Ruby master - Feature #13770

Can't create valid Cyrillic-named class/module

07/26/2017 12:22 PM - sb (Sergey Borodanov)

Status: Closed
Priority: Normal
Assignee: matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
Target version:

Description
Can't create a valid Cyrillic-named class. If I have a file мир.rb:

```ruby
# Content of мир.rb:
class Мир
  def приветствовать
    "Привет, Мир!"
  end
end
```

and do in bash:

```bash
ruby мир.rb
```

I get the error (SyntaxError):

мер.rb:1: class/module name must be CONSTANT

Same error with module creating and same behavior in irb (please, see attachment). At the same time Cyrillic-named constants and methods work fine.

It is expected that creating Cyrillic-named class/modules should work without error.

Related issues:
Related to Ruby master - Bug #11859: Regexp matching with \p{Upper} and \p{Lo... Rejected
Has duplicate Ruby master - Bug #15524: Unicode not Supported in Class Names Rejected

Associated revisions
Revision f852af0e - 04/10/2018 12:41 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
symbol.c: non-ASCII constant names

- symbol.c (rb_sym_constant_char_p): support for non-ASCII constant names. [Feature #13770]
- object.c (rb_mod_const_get, rb_mod_const_defined): support for non-ASCII constant names.

Revision 63130 - 04/10/2018 12:41 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
symbol.c: non-ASCII constant names

- symbol.c (rb_sym_constant_char_p): support for non-ASCII constant names. [Feature #13770]
- object.c (rb_mod_const_get, rb_mod_const_defined): support for non-ASCII constant names.

Revision 63130 - 04/10/2018 12:41 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
symbol.c: non-ASCII constant names

- symbol.c (rb_sym_constant_char_p): support for non-ASCII constant names. [Feature #13770]
- object.c (rb_mod_const_get, rb_mod_const_defined): support for non-ASCII constant names.

History

#1 - 07/26/2017 12:46 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
Constant names must start with an upper case in ASCII.

#2 - 07/26/2017 02:25 PM - matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
And maybe it's time to relax the limitation for Non-ASCII capital letters to start constant names.
Matz.

#3 - 07/26/2017 05:32 PM - shevegen (Robert A. Heiler)
Martin Dürst could then create classes for all Emojis in Unicode. :D

#4 - 07/27/2017 12:40 AM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)
matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto) wrote:

And maybe it's time to relax the limitation for Non-ASCII capital letters to start constant names.

What do you think of Titlecase? Are they allowed?

http://unicode.org/faq/casemap_charprop.html#4

#5 - 07/27/2017 06:19 AM - phluid61 (Matthew Kerwin)
shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe) wrote:

matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto) wrote:

And maybe it's time to relax the limitation for Non-ASCII capital letters to start constant names.

What do you think of Titlecase? Are they allowed?

http://unicode.org/faq/casemap_charprop.html#4

Isn't titlecase a mapping property, rather than an attribute? That is, how a character would be converted to titlecase is orthogonal to whether it's uppercase.

#6 - 07/27/2017 06:27 AM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)
phluid61 (Matthew Kerwin) wrote:

shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe) wrote:

matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto) wrote:

And maybe it's time to relax the limitation for Non-ASCII capital letters to start constant names.

What do you think of Titlecase? Are they allowed?

http://unicode.org/faq/casemap_charprop.html#4

Isn't titlecase a mapping property, rather than an attribute? That is, how a character would be converted to titlecase is orthogonal to whether it's uppercase.

Can I ask you whether U+01C8 is a valid Constant name or not in your opinion? and why?
shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe) wrote:

Isn't titlecase a mapping property, rather than an attribute? That is, how a character would be converted to titlecase is orthogonal to whether it's uppercase.

Can I ask you whether U+01C8 is a valid Constant name or not in your opinion? and why?

Oh, you're right, I had misread the documentation.

I think that if Ruby accepts all Lu characters as constants, it could also accept all Lt. In the case of U+01C8 I'm not overly concerned because it's not common any more (but I think Ljudevit is just as valid as Ljudevit); however for U+01F2 it could be reasonable for someone in Macedonia to name a constant Dze, for example.

OK, I see. Thank you.

shevegen (Robert A. Heiler) wrote:

Martin Dürst could then create classes for all Emojis in Unicode. :D

Well, it's unclear whether emoji (note the Japanese plural!) are upper-case or lower-case. I thought maybe we could make a distinction between children (lower-case) and adults (upper-case), but there are not many children, tons of adults, and tons of other stuff (not to say gunk).

matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto) wrote:

And maybe it's time to relax the limitation for Non-ASCII capital letters to start constant names.

I agree. Here are some pointers for implementation:

The distinction between constants (tCONSTANT) and identifiers (tIDENTIFIER) is made at parse.c:7830 using macro ISUPPER. Some other uses of ISUPPER (but not all of them) seem to be related to this distinction, e.g. the one at symbol.c:281.

ISUPPER is defined using rb_isupper in include/ruby/ruby.h, the later being defined inline in the same file, as 'A' <= c && c <= 'Z'. This would have to be replaced with a call to ONIGENC_IS_CODE_CTYPE or so, which would work for legacy encodings. For Unicode-based encodings, where we want to into account titlecase (thanks, Shyouhei!), it may be slightly more complicated.

A question we might want to check for is if there's any code out there that currently uses non-ASCII upper-case variable names.

Another question is whether we might want to have some convention for Japanese, e.g. Katakana for class names. Just thinking out loud (and ducking).

nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada) wrote:

To distinguish non-ASCII upper/lower cases would lead non-ASCII punctuations too. ASCII punctuations cannot be a part of identifiers, will non-ASCII versions be same?

BTW, I think Japanese has no or little concept of plural, except that some words imply "many" and some suffixes.

nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada) wrote:

I'm uncertain about the usage of mbc_case_fold.
static enum yylex
parse_ident(struct parser_params *parser, int c, int cmd_state)
{
pushback(c);
}
-
-7827,7 +7829,9 @@ parse_ident(struct parser_params *parser, int c, int cmd_state)
pushback(c);
}
|-7827,7 +7829,9 @@ parse_ident(struct parser_params *parser, int c, int cmd_state)
pushback(c);
}
- if (result == 0 && ISUPPER(tok()[0])) {
+ if (result == 0 &&
+ (ISUPPER(tok()[0]) ||
+ rb_enc_const_id_char_p(tok(), tok()+toklen(), current_enc)))
+ result = tCONSTANT;
} else {

diff --git i/symbol.c w/symbol.c
index f4516ebbe4..490cae0127 100644
--- i/symbol.c
+++ w/symbol.c
@@ -198,6 +198,28 @@
rb_enc_symname_p(const char *name, rb_encoding *enc)
 return rb_enc_symname2_p(name, strlen(name), enc);
}
+int
+rb_enc_const_id_char_p(const char *name, const char *end, rb_encoding *enc)
+{
+ int c, len;
+ if (end <= name) return FALSE;
+ if (ISASCII(*name)) return ISUPPER(*name);
+ c = rb_enc_codepoint_len(name, end, &len, enc);
+ if (c < 0) return FALSE;
+ if (rb_enc_isupper(c, enc)) return TRUE;
+ 
+ OnigUChar fold[ONIGENC_GET_CASE_FOLD_CODES_MAX_NUM];
+ const OnigUChar *beg = (const OnigUChar *)name;
+ int r = enc->mbc_case_fold(ONIGENC_CASE_FOLD,
+ &beg, (const OnigUChar *)end,
+ fold, enc);
+ if (r > 0 && (r != len || memcmp(fold, name, r)))
+ return TRUE;
+ }
+ return FALSE;
+
+#define IDSET_ATTRSET_FOR_SYNTAX (((1U<<ID_LOCAL)|(1U<<ID_CONST))
+#define IDSET_ATTRSET_FOR_INTERN (~(~0U<<(1<<ID_SCOPE_SHIFT)) & ~(1U<<ID_ATTRSET))

@@ -278,7 +300,7 @@
break;

default:
- type = ISUPPER(*m) ? ID_CONST : ID_LOCAL;
+ type = rb_enc_const_id_char_p(m, e, enc) ? ID_CONST : ID_LOCAL;

id:
- if (m >= e || (*m != '_' && !ISALPHA(*m) && ISASCII(*m)))
- if (len > 1 && *(e-1) == '=') {
+ if (rb_enc_islower(c, enc)) return FALSE;

#13 - 08/01/2017 11:21 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Backport deleted (2.2: UNKNOWN, 2.3: UNKNOWN, 2.4: UNKNOWN)
- ruby -v deleted (2.4.1p111 (2017-03-22 revision 58053) [x86_64-linux])
- Tracker changed from Bug to Feature

#14 - 08/18/2017 12:41 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Assignee set to matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#15 - 08/31/2017 09:06 AM - duerst (Martin Dürst)
In the patch, I suggest adding something like
if (rb_enc_islower(c, enc)) return FALSE;
I have checked for upper-case letters without corresponding lower-case letters, with the following short script:

```ruby
ruby -n -e 'l=_.split(/;/); if l[2]=="Lu" && l[13]=="" then puts l[1];end' <UnicodeData.txt
```

Somewhat contrary to my expectations, this turned up quite a number of characters (471 of them). Most are MATHEMATICAL symbols in the range U+1D400 to U+1D7FF. My understanding is that they don't have mappings because mathematicians use upper-case and lower-case symbols with different meanings.

There are some other upper-case characters without defined lower-case equivalents, but most of the correspond to empty slots in the MATHEMATICAL symbols charts.

The above patch would treat all identifiers starting with upper-case, even MATHEMATICAL symbols, as class names. Unless we want to forbid such characters in identifiers, I think that’s the right thing to do.

What’s more important for the above patch is that there are no title-case characters without lower-case mappings, so

```ruby
+ if (r > 0 && (r != len || memcmp(fold, name, r)))
+   return TRUE;
+ }
```

in the patch will work correctly.

What is more important for the above patch is whether

**#17 - 09/06/2017 09:54 AM - duerst (Martin Dürst)**

sb (Sergey Borodanov) wrote:

Same error with module creating and same behavior in `irb` (please, see attachment). At the same time Cyrillic-named constants and methods work fine.

Methods indeed should work fine, because currently all non-ASCII characters are lumped together as lower-case. But I don’t think constants work fine; it may only look so.

Please try e.g.

```ruby
ruby -e 'Мир = 55; Мир = 77'
```

You should get a warning saying the the constant was already initialized. I don’t get such a warning, which means that Мир here is treated as a variable, not as a constant.

**#18 - 09/06/2017 10:02 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)**

duerst (Martin Dürst) wrote:

In the patch, I suggest adding something like

```ruby
if (rb_enc_islower(c, enc)) return FALSE;
```
symbol.c: non-ASCII constant names

- symbol.c (rb_sym_constant_char_p): support for non-ASCII constant names. [Feature #13770]
- object.c (rb_mod_const_get, rb_mod_const_defined): support for non-ASCII constant names.

Files

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>File Name</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Screenshot from 2017-07-26 19-08-14.png</td>
<td>64.2 KB</td>
<td>07/26/2017</td>
<td>sb (Sergey Borodanov)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>