Ruby master - Feature #14397
public, protected and private should return their arguments instead of self
01/24/2018 09:27 PM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status:</th>
<th>Assigned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Priority:</td>
<td>Normal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignee:</td>
<td>matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target version:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description**
Matsuda-san suggested me that public, protected and private should return their arguments instead of self, to write such code:

```ruby
require "finalist"
# see https://github.com/joker1007/finalist
class Foo
  extend Finalist
  final private def foo
  end
end
```

I believe that it's reasonable request, and also believe that there is no product code which uses the return values of public, protected and private.
Matz, how do you think about this change?
The patch is attached.

**Related issues:**
- Related to CommonRuby - Feature #11541: Let attr_accessor, _reader & _writer ...
  - Open
- Has duplicate Ruby master - Feature #14396: public, protected and private sho...
  - Rejected

**History**

**#1 - 01/24/2018 09:28 PM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)**
- Has duplicate Feature #14396: public, protected and private should return their arguments instead of self added

**#2 - 01/25/2018 12:20 PM - Eregon (Benoit Daloze)**
- Related to Feature #11541: Let attr_accessor, _reader & _writer return symbols of the defined methods added

**#3 - 01/25/2018 12:23 PM - Eregon (Benoit Daloze)**
Would it be simpler for the semantics to always return an Array of symbols?
Otherwise final (and other potential uses) has to handle both a single Symbol and an Array of Symbol.

One concern is the extra allocations for the common case of a single argument given to private.

**#4 - 12/10/2018 07:08 AM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)**
- Target version deleted (2.6)

**Files**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>File</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>return_values_of_visibility_methods.diff</td>
<td>7.47 KB</td>
<td>01/24/2018</td>
<td>usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>