Ruby master - Bug #14674

New mismatched indentations warnings?

04/10/2018 05:43 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status:</th>
<th>Closed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Priority:</td>
<td>Normal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignee:</td>
<td>nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target version:</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ruby -v:

```
ruby 2.6.0dev (2018-04-11 trunk 63132)
x86_64-darwin15
```

Backport:

```
2.3: UNKNOWN, 2.4: UNKNOWN, 2.5: UNKNOWN
```

Description

I recently got a failure in my test suite because ruby head warns of indentation it considers mismatched:

```
$ ruby -w -e "
case
  when :foo
end
"
-e:3: warning: mismatched indentations at 'when' with 'case' at 2
```

I hope this is not intentional and will be fixed.

Associated revisions

Revision a3a5f38d - 04/12/2018 10:13 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: when indent
  parse.y (k_when): warn less-indented when than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@63141 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 63141 - 04/12/2018 10:13 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: when indent
  parse.y (k_when): warn less-indented when than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

Revision 63141 - 04/12/2018 10:13 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: when indent
  parse.y (k_when): warn less-indented when than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

Revision 3b93a8bc - 04/16/2018 08:54 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: else indent
  parse.y (keyword_else): warn less-indented else than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@63165 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 63165 - 04/16/2018 08:54 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: else indent
  parse.y (keyword_else): warn less-indented else than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

Revision 63165 - 04/16/2018 08:54 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

```
parse.y: else indent
  parse.y (keyword_else): warn less-indented else than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]
```

History

#1 - 04/11/2018 07:17 AM - shevegen (Robert A. Heiler)
I think in the long run it would be nice if ruby hackers have more control over non-error messages (e.g. warnings).

Some may prefer ruby providing cues for a more consistent code layout but others may not necessarily care that much. In both situations it would be nice to be able to decide on the verbosity level of warnings.

#2 - 04/12/2018 02:30 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
It was intentional, but mismatched with your style?

#3 - 04/12/2018 05:11 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)
I strongly believe that it is not Ruby's parser job to warn us about styling, especially if there's no strong reason to suspect that it's a programmer error.

I realize rubocop is not official or part of MRI, but it has the required qualities to do this:
1) requires opt-in (i.e. users wanting to enforce a particular style can use rubocop; others don't need to)
2) configurable (i.e. rules can be turned off or tweaked)
3) exception can be dealt with with comments in the code (e.g. # rubocop:disable Some/Rule)
4) warning/errors are generated when desired, not all the time (e.g. during tests/manually, but not when actually running the code)

rubocop can even autocorrect according to these desired specs. Ruby MRI has none of these features!

Note that rubocop already supports Layout/Caselndentation, can issue warning, error, or ignore it. It supports two different alignment styles, and supports any desired indent.

In short: warnings should be kept to a strict minimum in MRI, and enforcing a style for case/when is a terrible use of a warning.

Would you consider reverting this, or asking Matz?

#4 - 04/12/2018 07:23 AM - zverok (Victor Shepelev)
I agree with marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune). I used to prefer "indented when" style once, and still think it is pretty acceptable.

When Ruby has introduced interpreter warnings about mismatched indentation, I thought it is a good thing, allowing to catch obvious typos like this:

def foo
  bar.each do
  end # forgot to close do/end of "each", hard to spot after a large methods
  #...
  # Without that warning, the interpreter error about missing "end" at the very end of the file,
  # far from the actual point of error

But for being useful this way, the interpreter should report only absolutely obvious and unambiguous typos, not "non-preferred style". Ruby is too mature to introduce hardcoded style preferences, I believe.

#5 - 04/12/2018 10:13 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Status changed from Open to Closed

Applied in changeset trunk|r63141.

parse.y: when indent

  * parse.y (k_when): warn less-indented when than case. [ruby-core:86492] [Bug #14674]