Ruby master - Bug #4443
odd evaluation order in a multiple assignment
02/24/2011 11:28 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

Status: Closed
Priority: Normal
Assignee: ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
Target version: 
ruby -v:
Backport:

Description
遠藤です。core に投げてしまったようなので登録し直し。
Ruby は左から右に評価が進むと信じていたのですが、多重代入で裏切られました。
def foo
  p :foo
  []
end
def bar
  p :bar
end
x, foo[0] = bar, 0
bar foo [] bar foo []

IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IRC
IR
Ruby would previously call bar, then baz, then abc, then def= on the result of abc, then foo, then []= on the result of foo.

This change makes multiple assignment similar to single assignment, changing the evaluation order of the above multiple assignment code to calling abc, then foo, then bar, then baz, then def= on the result of abc, then []= on the result of foo.

Implementing this is challenging with the stack-based virtual machine. We need to keep track of all of the left hand side attribute setter receivers and setter arguments, and then keep track of the stack level while handling the assignment processing, so we can issue the appropriate topn instructions to get the receiver. Here's an example of how the multiple assignment is executed, showing the stack and instructions:

```
self            # putself
abc             # send
abc, self       # putself
abc, foo        # send
abc, foo, 0     # putobject 0
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz] # evaluate RHS
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, bar  # expandarray
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, bar, abc  # topn 5
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, abc, bar  # swap
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, def=  # send
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz  # pop
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo  # topn 3
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo, 0  # topn 3
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo, 0, baz  # topn 2
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, [bar]=  # send
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz  # pop
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz]  # pop
[bar, baz], foo, 0, [bar, baz]  # setn 3
[bar, baz], foo  # pop
[bar, baz]  # pop
```

As multiple assignment must deal with splats, post args, and any level of nesting, it gets quite a bit more complex than this in non-trivial cases. To handle this, struct masgn_state is added to keep track of the overall state of the mass assignment, which stores a linked list of struct masgn_atrasgn, one for each assigned attribute.

This adds a new optimization that replaces a topn 1/pop instruction combination with a single swap instruction for multiple assignment to non-aref attributes.

This new approach isn't compatible with one of the optimizations previously used, in the case where the multiple assignment return value was not needed, there was no lhs splat, and one of the left hand side used an attribute setter. This removes that optimization. Removing the optimization allowed for removing the POP_ELEMENT and adjust_stack functions.

This adds a benchmark to measure how much slower multiple assignment is with the correct evaluation order.

This benchmark shows:

- 4-9% decrease for attribute sets
- 14-23% decrease for array member sets
- Basically same speed for local variable sets

Importantly, it shows no significant difference between the popped (where return value of the multiple assignment is not needed) and lopped (where return value of the multiple assignment is needed) cases for attribute and array member sets. This indicates the previous optimization, which was dropped in the evaluation order fix and only affected the popped case, is not important to performance.
History

#1 - 03/26/2011 10:25 PM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)
- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#2 - 06/11/2011 03:49 PM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)

#3 - 06/11/2011 04:04 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)
http://redmine.ruby-lang.org/issues/4440

#4 - 06/11/2011 10:29 PM - matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
- ruby -v changed from ruby 1.9.2p0 (2010-08-18 revision 29036) [i686-linux] to -

#5 - 06/11/2011 10:29 PM - matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)

#6 - 10/18/2011 09:16 AM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)
- Project changed from Ruby master to 14
- Target version deleted (3.0)

#7 - 10/23/2011 05:21 PM - naruse (Yui NARUSE)
- Project changed from 14 to Ruby master

#8 - 04/10/2012 06:35 PM - matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
あ、それはそれでいいかなと思います。

ちなみに ISO とかの標準的にはどうなってるんでしょう？

--

Yusuke Endoh  mame@tsg.ne.jp

手元にある JIS x3017 のドラフトを見ると現状の評価順（多重代入の場合には右辺が先）が記述してありますね（11.4.2.4）。

どうしたもんだか。

#11 - 07/14/2012 02:51 PM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
- Assignee changed from matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto) to ko1 (Koichi Sasada)

#12 - 07/14/2012 02:56 PM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

duplicated (http://bugs.ruby-lang.org/issues/4443)

#13 - 10/26/2012 05:33 AM - nahi (Hiroshi Nakamura)
- Status changed from Closed to Open

It looks to be closed by mistake.

#14 - 10/30/2012 09:06 AM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
- Category set to core
- Target version set to 2.6

...feasibility feature 考え方がある
2.0 の場合は次の minor に

#15 - 08/21/2015 09:09 PM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
- Description updated

#16 - 01/31/2017 09:01 AM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)
- Description updated

...考えます（いつだろう…）。

#17 - 04/28/2017 01:45 PM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)
- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#18 - 01/24/2018 08:36 AM - akr (Akira Tanaka)
- Description updated: ruby-dev:31579

1)  2)  3)  4)  5)  6)  7)  8)  9)  10)  11)  12)  13)  14)  15)  16)  17)  18)  19)  20)  21)  22)  23)  24)  25)  26)  27)  28)  29)  30)  31)  32)  33)  34)  35)  36)  37)  38)  39)  40)  41)  42)  43)  44)  45)  46)  47)  48)  49)  50)  51)  52)  53)  54)  55)  56)  57)  58)  59)  60)  61)  62)  63)  64)  65)  66)  67)  68)  69)  70)  71)  72)  73)  74)  75)  76)  77)  78)  79)  80)  81)  82)  83)  84)  85)  86)  87)  88)  89)  90)  91)  92)  93)  94)  95)  96)  97)  98)  99)  100)

#19 - 04/20/2021 12:11 AM - jeremyevans0 (Jeremy Evans)
I have submitted a pull request to fix multiple assignment evaluation order: https://github.com/ruby/ruby/pull/4390

#20 - 04/21/2021 05:49 PM - jeremyevans (Jeremy Evans)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed
Evaluate multiple assignment left hand side before right hand side

In regular assignment, Ruby evaluates the left hand side before the right hand side. For example:

```ruby
foo[0] = bar
```

Calls foo, then bar, then `[]=` on the result of foo.

Previously, multiple assignment didn’t work this way. If you did:

```ruby
abc.def, foo[0] = bar, baz
```

Ruby would previously call bar, then baz, then abc, then `def=` on the result of abc, then foo, then `[]=` on the result of foo.

This change makes multiple assignment similar to single assignment, changing the evaluation order of the above multiple assignment code to calling abc, then foo, then bar, then baz, then `def=` on the result of abc, then `[]=` on the result of foo.

Implementing this is challenging with the stack-based virtual machine. We need to keep track of all of the left hand side attribute setter receivers and setter arguments, and then keep track of the stack level while handling the assignment processing, so we can issue the appropriate `topn` instructions to get the receiver. Here's an example of how the multiple assignment is executed, showing the stack and instructions:

```
self # putself
abc  # send
abc, self # putself
abc, foo # send
abc, foo, 0 # putobject 0
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz] # evaluate RHS
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, bar # expandarray
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, bar, abc # topn 5
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, abc, bar # swap
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, def= # send
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz # pop
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo # topn 3
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo, 0 # topn 3
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, foo, 0, baz # topn 2
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz, [ ]= # send
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz], baz # pop
abc, foo, 0, [bar, baz] # pop
[bar, baz].foo, 0, [bar, baz] # setn 3
[bar, baz], foo, 0 # pop
[bar, baz], foo # pop
[bar, baz] # pop
```

As multiple assignment must deal with splats, post args, and any level of nesting, it gets quite a bit more complex than this in non-trivial cases. To handle this, struct masgn_state is added to keep track of the overall state of the mass assignment, which stores a linked list of struct masgn_atrasgn, one for each assigned attribute.

This adds a new optimization that replaces a `topn 1/pop` instruction combination with a single `swap` instruction for multiple assignment to non-aref attributes.

This new approach isn't compatible with one of the optimizations previously used, in the case where the multiple assignment return value was not needed, there was no lhs splat, and one of the left hand side used an attribute setter. This removes that optimization. Removing the optimization allowed for removing the `POP_ELEMENT` and `adjust_stack` functions.

This adds a benchmark to measure how much slower multiple assignment is with the correct evaluation order.
This benchmark shows:

- 4-9% decrease for attribute sets
- 14-23% decrease for array member sets
- Basically same speed for local variable sets

Importantly, it shows no significant difference between the popped (where return value of the multiple assignment is not needed) and !popped (where return value of the multiple assignment is needed) cases for attribute and array member sets. This indicates the previous optimization, which was dropped in the evaluation order fix and only affected the popped case, is not important to performance.

Fixes [Bug #4443]

#21 - 05/05/2021 03:24 PM - Eregon (Benoit Daloze)
- Related to Bug #15928: Constant declaration does not conform to JIS 3017:2013 added

#22 - 05/05/2021 03:46 PM - Eregon (Benoit Daloze)
I wrote some concerns over this change in https://bugs.ruby-lang.org/issues/15928#note-10.
I think the previous semantics of multiple assignments are better for various reasons.
We could change single assignment order, always evaluate RHS first, like MRuby behaves, if consistency is wanted.