

Ruby master - Bug #5728

SystemExit.new(bool, message)

12/08/2011 05:45 PM - akr (Akira Tanaka)

Status: Closed	
Priority: Normal	
Assignee:	
Target version:	
ruby -v: -	Backport:
Description	
<p>I found SystemExit.new doesn't take a bool as exit status:</p> <p>It works well if an integer is given for status.</p> <pre>% ./ruby -e 'SystemExit.new(0, "msg")' % ./ruby -e 'SystemExit.new(1, "msg")'</pre> <p>But it doesn't work if the status is a bool.</p> <pre>% ./ruby -e 'SystemExit.new(true, "msg")' -e:1:in initialize: wrong number of arguments (2 for 0..1) (ArgumentError) from -e:1:in initialize' from -e:1:in new' from -e:1:in ' % ./ruby -e 'SystemExit.new(false, "msg")' -e:1:in initialize: wrong number of arguments (2 for 0..1) (ArgumentError) from -e:1:in initialize' from -e:1:in new' from -e:1:in ' % ./ruby -v ruby 2.0.0dev (2011-12-08 trunk 33981) [x86_64-linux]</pre> <p>I think SystemExit.new should accept a bool.</p>	

Associated revisions

Revision ea82d480 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@34008 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

Revision 34008 - 12/11/2011 01:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug #5728]

History

#1 - 12/08/2011 08:29 PM - kosaki (Motohiro KOSAKI)

I think SystemExit.new should accept a bool.

We have two choice and both are a lot of confusable.

- 1) true => EXIT_SUCCESS, false => EXIT_FAILURE
People may dislike it because true mapped 0 and false mapped 1.
- 2) true => EXIT_FAILURE, false => EXIT_SUCCESS
People also may dislike it. Because true usually isn't used for failure.

As far as EXIT_SUCCESS==0, I doubt we can make natural conversion.

#2 - 12/08/2011 08:58 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

=begin
I don't think we have two.

The latter choice is not acceptable, since the return value of (Kernel#system) and the first argument of (Kernel#exit) are same as the former.

And should not assume (EXIT_SUCCESS) to be 0.
=end

#3 - 12/08/2011 10:53 PM - akr (Akira Tanaka)

- ruby -v changed from ruby 2.0.0dev (2011-12-08 trunk 33981) [x86_64-linux] to -

2011/12/8 Nobuyoshi Nakada nobu@ruby-lang.org:

I don't think we have two.

The latter choice is not acceptable, since the return value of (Kernel#system) and the first argument of (Kernel#exit) are same as the former.

And should not assume (EXIT_SUCCESS) to be 0.

Agreed.

In addition, if this issue ([#5728](#)) and Process::EXIT_SUCCESS/Process::EXIT_FAILURE issue ([#5726](#)) are both rejected, it is very difficult to use SystemExit.new for EXIT_FAILURE.

--
Tanaka Akira

#4 - 12/08/2011 10:59 PM - kosaki (Motohiro KOSAKI)

I don't think we have two.

The latter choice is not acceptable, since the return value of (Kernel#system) and the first argument of (Kernel#exit) are same as the former.

And should not assume (EXIT_SUCCESS) to be 0.

Agreed.

In addition, if this issue ([#5728](#)) and Process::EXIT_SUCCESS/Process::EXIT_FAILURE issue ([#5726](#)) are both rejected, it is very difficult to use SystemExit.new for EXIT_FAILURE.

I overlooked Kernel#exit. then I withdraw my argument. Thank you for clarification. But, I'm still bit worry about confusable thing because a lot of people know EXIT_SUCCESS==0 on their platform. so please write a doc true convert to EXIT_SUCCESS, and not 1 clearly.

Thank you.

#5 - 12/11/2011 02:24 AM - akr (Akira Tanaka)

- *File system-exit-bool.patch added*

I wrote a patch.

#6 - 12/11/2011 10:48 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- *Status changed from Open to Closed*

- *% Done changed from 0 to 100*

This issue was solved with changeset r34008.
Akira, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

-
- error.c (exit_initialize): deal with true and false as well as Kernel#exit. [ruby-dev:44951] [Bug [#5728](#)]

Files

system-exit-bool.patch	1.56 KB	12/11/2011	akr (Akira Tanaka)
------------------------	---------	------------	--------------------