

Ruby master - Bug #6057

URI - Nonsensical Behavior

02/22/2012 10:34 AM - sgonyea (Scott Gonyea)

Status: Closed	
Priority: Normal	
Assignee: akira (akira yamada)	
Target version:	
ruby -v: 1.9.3-p125	Backport: 2.3: UNKNOWN, 2.4: UNKNOWN, 2.5: UNKNOWN
Description The behavior of Ruby's URI is confusing, to say the least. <pre>URI("http://foo.com/bar") + "baz" # => #<URI::HTTP:0x710713de URL:http://foo.com/baz></pre> <pre>URI.join("http://foo.com/baz", "bar") # => #<URI::HTTP:0x29fd5dc4 URL:http://foo.com/bar></pre> I could at least understand this behavior being the case if we were adding "/bar" (although it'd still be non-intuitive). That URI throws away its current path makes it a tedious library. Net::HTTP expects it as an input, yet as you interact with URI, you are constantly massaging it into and out of string form. In my opinion, URI should model the behavior of Pathname.	
Related issues:	
Related to Ruby master - Bug #15276: URI.join behaviour is unintuitive	Open
Has duplicate Ruby master - Bug #10075: URI#join needs documentation of its b...	Closed 07/19/2014

History

#1 - 02/22/2012 10:35 AM - sgonyea (Scott Gonyea)

Edit: Moronic comment redacted.

#2 - 02/22/2012 10:36 AM - sgonyea (Scott Gonyea)

I'd be happy to write this improved functionality. But would it be welcome?

#3 - 02/22/2012 10:57 AM - sgonyea (Scott Gonyea)

Another example:

```
URI.join("http://foo.com/baz", "bar", "bim")
```

=> #

Also, if we did model the behavior of Pathname, then joining of "/baz" would reset the path which I do think is acceptable and good behavior.

#4 - 02/22/2012 11:10 AM - duerst (Martin Dürst)

I have only done a few quick tests, but it seems that the '+' operator implements relative resolution (see <http://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc3986#section-5.2>). For URIs, this makes a lot of sense.

#5 - 02/22/2012 11:45 AM - sgonyea (Scott Gonyea)

Ah. That's the issue.

```
1.9.3-p125 :016 > uri = URI("http://google.com/foo/bar/")  
=> #  
1.9.3-p125 :017 > uri + "baz"  
=> #
```

If the URI's path itself has a trailing "/" then it will append the new path.

Likewise:

```
1.9.3-p125 :023 > URI.join("http://google.com/foo/", "bar", "baz")
=> #
1.9.3-p125 :024 > URI.join("http://google.com/foo/", "bar/", "baz")
=> #
1.9.3-p125 :025 >
```

How very unintuitive :(I guess the next question would be if URI.join actually needs to follow the merge rules to the letter, but I imagine that argument is moot :).

#6 - 02/22/2012 08:59 PM - Anonymous

In my opinion, URI should model the behavior of Pathname.

I totally agree.

Additionally I absolutely dislike using global methods instead of class factory methods. I think it isn't at all obvious and it poisons the global namespace.

URI.parse(args) over Kernel#URI(args)

#7 - 02/23/2012 10:46 AM - drbrain (Eric Hodel)

Changing the behavior of URI#+ from the current will break many libraries (including mechanize) that depend upon the current behavior of relative resolution.

The current behavior is frequently used to combine, for example, an anchor href with the current location to generate a new, correct URI if the href is a relative URI like "foo" or "../foo", a complete path like "/foo" or a complete URI like "<http://other.example/bar>".

#8 - 02/23/2012 11:23 AM - Anonymous

Scott Gonyea scott@aitrus.org writes:

Issue [#6057](#) has been updated by Scott Gonyea.

I'd be happy to write this improved functionality. But would it be welcome?

Is there anyone who actually *likes* this behavior?

#9 - 03/11/2012 05:36 PM - ko1 (Koichi Sasada)

- Assignee set to akira (akira yamada)

#10 - 03/18/2012 06:46 PM - shyouhei (Shyouhei Urabe)

- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#11 - 11/21/2018 12:26 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Description updated

#12 - 11/21/2018 11:33 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Has duplicate Bug [#10075](#): URI#join needs documentation of its behavior added

#13 - 11/21/2018 11:34 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Related to Bug [#15276](#): URI.join behaviour is unintuitive added

#14 - 11/21/2018 11:36 PM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

This ticket was duplicated by [Bug #10075](#): URI#join needs documentation of its behavior, and that ticket has been already closed with documentation improvement. So I'm closing this.

Files

smime.p7s	6.22 KB	02/22/2012	Anonymous
-----------	---------	------------	-----------