

Ruby trunk - Bug #7773

Calling send("attribute=", value) returns nil instead of value

02/03/2013 05:41 PM - gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney)

Status: Closed	
Priority: Normal	
Assignee: nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)	
Target version: 2.0.0	
ruby -v: 2.0.0-rc1	Backport:
Description	
When calling an attribute writer created using either attr_accessor or attr_writer via send nil is returned from the send call instead of the new value.	
I've attached a test case that is failing on current head (51794) and 2.0.0-rc1. I've done a git bisect and it looks like commit 37228 (db1e99cd) is the first offending commit.	
I've been able to reproduce on OS X 10.8 and Ubuntu 12.04.	

Associated revisions

Revision 6851ad47 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basiceinstructions.rb: Test for above

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@39121 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basiceinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basiceinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basiceinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- `vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer` should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- `test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb`: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- `vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer` should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- `test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb`: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- `vm_inshelper.c: attr_writer` should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- `test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb`: Test for above

History

#1 - 02/06/2013 09:59 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

Why do you consider it a bug?

#2 - 02/07/2013 12:06 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- Category set to core

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

- Target version set to 2.0.0

nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada) wrote:

Why do you consider it a bug?

I don't know about Chris, but here is why I consider it a bug:

- returning nil is less useful than value
- it is less intuitive too (to me)
- it is a change of behavior (possibly breaking some existing code)
- this change of behavior was never announced, discussed or approved AFAIK
- the referred commit has no stated or implied intention to change this
- the referred commit has no test to that effect

What I wonder is: why do you consider it could possibly be a feature?

#3 - 02/07/2013 01:01 AM - gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney)

I consider it a bug because the behavior only happens using `send`. If I were to call `bar=` directly (see below) it returns the value that was set.

```
class Foo
  attr_writer :bar
end
```

```
Foo.new.bar = "test" # => "test"
```

Should `send` behave differently than sending the message directly?

#4 - 02/07/2013 01:13 AM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Status changed from Open to Assigned
- Assignee set to nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney) wrote:

I consider it a bug because the behavior only happens using send.

Actually, it is not a bug itself.

An assignment-like method call always returns its right value rather than the return value from the method.

The following code shows the difference:

```
class Foo
  def foo=(x)
    "foo"
  end
end
x = Foo.new
p(x.foo = 42)    #=> 42
p(x.send(:foo=, 42)) #=> "foo"
```

However, as MarcAndre said, a method defined by attr_accessor used to return its argument, at least in ruby 1.9.3p194.

There seems to be a regression. Nobu, could you investigate it?

--

Yusuke Endoh mame@tsg.ne.jp

#5 - 02/07/2013 02:31 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

This issue was solved with changeset [r39121](#).

Chris, thank you for reporting this issue.

Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.

May Ruby be with you.

-
- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug [#7773](#)]
 - test/ruby/test_basiceinstructions.rb: Test for above

#6 - 02/07/2013 02:33 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

I meant to assign it to myself... in any case, it's fixed with [r39121](#).

Files

send_test.rb	280 Bytes	02/03/2013	gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney)
--------------	-----------	------------	--------------------------