Calling send("attribute=", value) returns nil instead of value

02/03/2013 05:41 PM - gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney)

Status: Closed
Priority: Normal
Assignee: nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
Target version: 2.0.0
ruby -v: 2.0.0-rc1

Description
When calling an attribute writer created using either attr_accessor or attr_writer via send nil is returned from the send call instead of the new value.

I've attached a test case that is failing on current head (51794) and 2.0.0-rc1. I've done a git bisect and it looks like commit 37228 (db1e99cd) is the first offending commit.

I've been able to reproduce on OS X 10.8 and Ubuntu 12.04.

Associated revisions
Revision 6851ad47 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb: Test for above

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@39121 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb: Test for above

Revision 39121 - 02/06/2013 05:31 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- vm_insnhelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/test_basicinstructions.rb: Test for above
Why do you consider it a bug?

- returning nil is less useful than value
- it is less intuitive too (to me)
- it is a change of behavior (possibly breaking some existing code)
- this change of behavior was never announced, discussed or approved AFAIK
- the referred commit has no stated or implied intention to change this
- the referred commit has no test to that effect

What I wonder is: why do you consider it could possibly be a feature?

I consider it a bug because the behavior only happens using send. If I were to call bar= directly (see below) it returns the value that was set.

class Foo
  attr_writer :bar
end

Foo.new.bar = "test" # => "test"

Should send behave differently than sending the message directly?
gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney) wrote:

I consider it a bug because the behavior only happens using send.

Actually, it is not a bug itself.
An assignment-like method call always returns its right value rather than the return value from the method.
The following code shows the difference:

class Foo
def foo=(x)
  "foo"
end
end
x = Foo.new
p(x.foo = 42) #=> 42
p(x.send(:foo=, 42)) #=> "foo"

However, as MarcAndre said, a method defined by attr_accessor used to return its argument, at least in ruby 1.9.3p194. There seems to be a regression. Nobu, could you investigate it?

--
Yusuke Endoh mame@tsg.ne.jp

#5 - 02/07/2013 02:31 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

This issue was solved with changeset r39121.
Chris, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

- vmInsnHelper.c: attr_writer should return its argument [Bug #7773]
- test/ruby/testBasicInstructions.rb: Test for above

#6 - 02/07/2013 02:33 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)
I meant to assign it to myself... in any case, it's fixed with r39121.

Files

| send_test.rb | 280 Bytes | 02/03/2013 | gaffneyc (Chris Gaffney) |