

Backport193 - Backport #8284

Expected behavior of Module#public_class_method

04/18/2013 03:17 AM - jacknagel (Jack Nagel)

Status:	Closed
Priority:	Normal
Assignee:	usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)
Description	
It was pointed out by Myron Marston (here: https://gist.github.com/myronmarston/5401829) that calling public_class_method on an anonymous module makes the named method public on Object, etc.	
Object.define_method => NoMethodError Module.new.public_class_method(:define_method) Object.define_method => ArgumentError	
Also of note, the same is not true when calling it on a class:	
Object.define_method => NoMethodError Class.new.public_class_method(:define_method) Object.define_method => NoMethodError	
which seems inconsistent given:	
Module.new.singleton_class.ancestors => [Module, Object, Kernel, BasicObject] Class.new.singleton_class.ancestors => [Class, Module, Object, Kernel, BasicObject]	
Is this a bug or expected behavior? If the latter, what is the correct explanation?	

Associated revisions

Revision 335dfa12 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@40346 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40346 - 04/18/2013 07:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 3c1b8a1b - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@40371 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision 40371 - 04/19/2013 08:09 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

test_module.rb: rename

- test/ruby/test_module.rb (test_visibility_by_public_class_method): rename because anonymousness is not a point. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]

Revision c967493b - 04/23/2013 02:32 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

merge revision(s) 40346: [Backport #8284]

```
* vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous
  module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base
  class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]
```

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_0_0@40427 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

History

#1 - 04/18/2013 04:59 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- Status changed from Open to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

This issue was solved with changeset r40346.
Jack, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

vm_method.c: fix visibility on anonymous module

- vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug [#8284](#)]

#2 - 04/18/2013 11:10 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- Tracker changed from Bug to Backport
- Project changed from Ruby master to Backport200
- Status changed from Closed to Assigned
- Assignee set to nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

This is a very very longstanding, 16 years old bug, since 1.0.

#3 - 04/19/2013 04:22 AM - moll (Andri Möll)

Well, it was actually reported by me to the RSpec project (<https://github.com/rspec/rspec-core/pull/873>) and the example I gave there involved a regular, not an anonymous module. The patch you made, nobu, tests only with an anonymous module, but does the fix also solve the visibility leakage for non anonymous modules?

With Ruby v1.9.3p385:

```
Object.define_method
NoMethodError: private method define_method' called for Object:Class
from (irb):1
from /usr/local/bin/irb:12:in'
module Foo
public_class_method :define_method
end
=> Foo
Object.define_method
ArgumentError: wrong number of arguments (0 for 1)
from (irb):3:in define_method'
from (irb):3
from /usr/local/bin/irb:12:in'
```

#4 - 04/19/2013 04:42 AM - jacknagel (Jack Nagel)

It does:

```
irb(main):001:0> RUBY_DESCRIPTION
=> "ruby 2.1.0dev (2013-04-19 trunk 40359) [i386-darwin10.8.0]"
irb(main):002:0> Object.define_method
NoMethodError: private method define_method' called for Object:Class
from (irb):2
from /Users/jacknagel/.rubies/ruby-2.1.0-dev/bin/irb:12:in'
irb(main):003:0> module Foo; public_class_method :define_method; end
=> Foo
irb(main):004:0> Object.define_method
NoMethodError: private method define_method' called for Object:Class
from (irb):4
from /Users/jacknagel/.rubies/ruby-2.1.0-dev/bin/irb:12:in'
```

#5 - 04/19/2013 04:44 AM - jacknagel (Jack Nagel)

As an aside, I see that this is now marked Backport 200, but it would be great if it was backported to 1.9.3 as well.

#6 - 04/19/2013 05:47 AM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

jacknagel (Jack Nagel) wrote:

As an aside, I see that this is now marked Backport 200, but it would be great if it was backported to 1.9.3 as well.

I don't know if it will be, but in any case there is always `singleton_class.send :public, :define_method` instead or equivalent.

It's a bit more clear, IMO, as using "public_class_method" on a Module is a bit strange... Modules don't really have "class methods".

FWIW, there are no specs in RubySpec about "public_class_method" on a Module.

#7 - 04/19/2013 01:37 PM - moll (Andri Möll)

jacknagel (Jack Nagel) wrote:

It does:

That's good. Now there's only a test missing for that. :)

#8 - 04/19/2013 11:45 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

I'll backport r40346 and r40371, and then move this ticket to Backport93.

#9 - 04/23/2013 11:32 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

This issue was solved with changeset r40427.

Jack, thank you for reporting this issue.

Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.

May Ruby be with you.

merge revision(s) 40346: [Backport [#8284](#)]

```
* vm_method.c (rb_mod_public_method): fix visibility on anonymous
  module. set visibility of singleton method, not method in base
  class. [ruby-core:54404] [Bug #8284]
```

#10 - 04/23/2013 11:34 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

- Project changed from Backport200 to Backport193

- Status changed from Closed to Assigned

- Assignee changed from nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga) to usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)

#11 - 05/14/2013 11:45 AM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)

Something is missing to backport the patch to ruby_1_9_3.

I'll check it later.

#12 - 10/21/2017 12:20 PM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)

- Status changed from Assigned to Rejected

1.9.3 is out of date

#13 - 10/21/2017 09:28 PM - marcandre (Marc-Andre Lafortune)

- Status changed from Rejected to Closed