block_given? (and the actual block) persist between calls to a proc created from a method (using method().to_proc()).

04/28/2013 06:32 AM - pythonesque (Joshua Yanovski)

Description
Confirmed on both 2.0.0 and 1.9.2-p290. A testcase (utilizing RSpec) is attached, but the behavior is easy to demonstrate without a testcase or RSpec.

First, we define a method that can optionally accept a block.

```ruby
def foo
  if block_given?
    yield
  else
    puts "No block given."
  end
end
```

Then, we convert the method to a proc and store it in a variable.

```ruby
method_to_proc = method(:foo).to_proc
```

Now, we try calling method_to_proc without a block, getting the expected result:

```ruby
method_to_proc.call
# => No block given.
```

We call it again, this time with a block, and again get the expected result:

```ruby
method_to_proc.call { puts "Block given." }
# => Block given.
```

But when we call it a third time, again with no block...

```ruby
method_to_proc.call
# => Block given.
```

...it remembers the previous proc that was passed in.

If we then call it with a new proc, it overwrites the old proc as expected (this is not tested in the testcase, which only tests block_given?):

```ruby
method_to_proc.call { puts "New block given." }
# => New block given.
```

The testcase verifies this behavior, and also that the behavior does not occur when calling a method in the usual way, or when using method() but not to_proc(), or when using method().to_proc() but not storing the result in the same variable (the last of which isn't that surprising but is included for completeness).

I cannot see any reason that this should be expected behavior. Either block_given? should work the same way in method.to_proc()s as it does in method(s), or it should always return false, and it certainly shouldn't "remember" the last block used.

Related issues:
- Related to Backport193 - Backport #8531: ifuncに渡したブロックが共有される

Associated revisions
- Revision 7d753a99 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
  test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
  git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@41342 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

- Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
  test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

Revision 41342 - 06/17/2013 01:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

Revision 1720a5ba - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
  run related tests.

Revision 1720a5ba - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
  run related tests.

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@41359 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 41359 - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
  run related tests.

Revision 41359 - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
  run related tests.

Revision 41359 - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)
- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block): new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing. [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls): run related tests.

Revision 41359 - 06/17/2013 12:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block): new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed as an argument.

- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing. [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls): run related tests.

Revision ab4e82fe - 06/18/2013 06:22 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)
merge revision(s) 41342,41359,41361: [Backport #8341]

- test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
  * include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block): new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed as an argument.

  * proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing. [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]
Revision bbe36f64 - 06/26/2013 07:55 AM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)
merge revision(s) 41342,41359,41361: [Backport #8341]

    test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
    * include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
      new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed as an argument.
    * proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
      [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]
    * test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
      run related tests.
    * test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_given_method_to_proc):
      run test for r41359.

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_1_9_3@41650 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 41650 - 06/26/2013 07:55 AM - usa (Usaku NAKAMURA)
merge revision(s) 41342,41359,41361: [Backport #8341]

    test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
    * include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
      new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed as an argument.
    * proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
      [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]
    * test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
      run related tests.
    * test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_given_method_to_proc):
      run test for r41359.

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_0_0@41392 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

History

#1 - 06/16/2013 03:29 AM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)
- File 8341.patch added
- Assignee set to ko1 (Koichi Sasada)

bmcall(ifunc) should use a block set by vm_yield_with_cfunc instead of PASSED_BLOCK.
I attached a patch.

#2 - 06/17/2013 09:59 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Category set to core
- Assignee changed from ko1 (Koichi Sasada) to ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)

LTGM

#3 - 06/17/2013 10:00 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Status changed from Open to Assigned

#4 - 06/17/2013 10:01 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

08/05/2021
This issue was solved with changeset r41342.
Joshua, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

---

test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]

#5 - 06/17/2013 10:24 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Status changed from Closed to Assigned
- % Done changed from 100 to 0
- Backport changed from 1.9.3: UNKNOWN, 2.0.0: UNKNOWN to 1.9.3: REQUIRED, 2.0.0: REQUIRED

#6 - 06/17/2013 09:38 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

This issue was solved with changeset r41359.
Joshua, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

- include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.
- proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]
- test/ruby/test_proc.rb (TestProc#test_block_persist_between_calls):
  run related tests.

#7 - 06/17/2013 09:50 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)
- Tracker changed from Bug to Backport
- Project changed from Ruby master to Backport200
- Category deleted (core)
- Status changed from Closed to Assigned
- Assignee changed from ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto) to nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

Please backport r41342, r41359.

#8 - 06/17/2013 10:30 PM - ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)
Oops, r41361 is also needed.

#9 - 06/19/2013 03:22 AM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)
- Status changed from Assigned to Closed

This issue was solved with changeset r41392.
Joshua, thank you for reporting this issue.
Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated.
May Ruby be with you.

merge revision(s) 41342,41359,41361: [Backport #8341]

test/ruby/test_proc.rb: tests for [Bug #8341]
* include/ruby/intern.h, proc.c (rb_method_call_with_block):
  new function to invoke a Method object with a block passed
  as an argument.
* proc.c (bmcall): use the above function to avoid a block sharing.
  [ruby-core:54626] [Bug #8341]
merge revision(s) 41342,41359,41361: [Backport #8341]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Files</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>testcase.rb</td>
<td>1.67 KB</td>
<td>04/28/2013</td>
<td>pythonesque (Joshua Yanovski)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8341.patch</td>
<td>2.32 KB</td>
<td>06/16/2013</td>
<td>ktsj (Kazuki Tsujimoto)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>