Ruby double-splat operator unexpectedly modifies hash

04/25/2014 08:12 PM - jessesielaff (Jesse Sielaff)

Status: Closed
Priority: Normal
Assignee: matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)
Target version: 2.2.0
ruby -v: ruby 2.1.1p76 (2014-02-24 revision 45161) [x86_64-linux]
Backport: 2.0.0: DONTNEED, 2.1: DONE

Description

I noticed what I find to be a very surprising behavior with the double-splat (** operator in Ruby 2.1.1.

When key-value pairs are used before a **hash, the hash remains unmodified. However, when key-value pairs are only used after the **hash, the hash is permanently modified.

```ruby
h = { b: 2 }
{ a: 1, **h }    # => { a: 1, b: 2 }
{ a: 1, **h, c: 3 }   # => { a: 1, b: 2, c: 3 }
{ **h, c: 3 }      # => { b: 2, c: 3 }
```

For comparison, consider the behavior of the splat (*) operator on arrays:

```ruby
a = [2]
[1, *a]      # => [1, 2]
{ a: 1, **h, a: 99, **h } # => {:a=>99}
```

Tsuyoshi Sawada has also highlighted that the expression's result is the self-same object as the original hash:

```
h.object_id == { **h, c: 3 }.object_id # => true
```

I investigated parse.y to try to determine the error there, but I couldn't narrow it down any further than the list_concat or rb_ary_push function calls in the assocs : block of the grammar.

Without exhaustively examining the C source, I think the best clue to the mechanism behind the erroneous behavior might be the following:

```ruby
h = { a: 1 }
{ **h, a: 99, **h } # => {:a=>99}
```

That we don't see {:a=>1} illustrates that h[a] is already overwritten by the time the second **h is evaluated.

Here is the use case that led me to this discovery:
def foo (arg) arg end
h = { a: 1 }
foo(**h, b: 2)

h #=> { a: 1, b: 2 }

In the above example, I don't want { b: 2 } permanently added to my existing hash. I'm currently solving it like this:

h = { a: 1 }

foo(**h.dup, b: 2)

h #=> { a: 1 }

The call to #dup feels unnecessary, and is inconsistent with the analogous behavior when using the single * operator. If this bug is fixed, I'll be able to eliminate that call.

Associated revisions
Revision 37e432b5 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]
git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/trunk@45724 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 45724 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

Revision 45724 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

Revision 45724 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

Revision 45724 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

Revision 45724 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

• compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive. [ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

Revision 5a2f6a4a - 06/16/2014 03:59 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

Revision 5a2f6a4a - 06/16/2014 03:59 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)
merge revision(s) r45724: [Backport #9776]

* compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive.

[ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

git-svn-id: svn+ssh://ci.ruby-lang.org/ruby/branches/ruby_2_1@46451 b2dd03c8-39d4-4d8f-98ff-823fe69b080e

Revision 46451 - 06/16/2014 03:59 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)

merge revision(s) r45724: [Backport #9776]

* compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive.
[ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

History

#1 - 04/25/2014 08:30 PM - jessesielaff (Jesse Sielaff)

Origin:


#2 - 04/26/2014 01:54 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Backport changed from 2.0.0: UNKNOWN, 2.1: UNKNOWN to 2.0.0: DONTNEED, 2.1: REQUIRED

#3 - 04/26/2014 01:55 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)
- Status changed from Open to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset r45724.

compile.c: non-destructive keyword splat

- compile.c (compile_array_): make copy a first hash not to modify the argument itself. keyword splat should be non-destructive.
[ruby-core:62161] [Bug #9776]

#4 - 06/16/2014 04:00 PM - nagachika (Tomoyuki Chikanaga)
- Backport changed from 2.0.0: DONTNEED, 2.1: REQUIRED to 2.0.0: DONTNEED, 2.1: DONE

Backported into ruby_2_1 branch at r46451.